The Red Ensign and the Maple Leaf: Canada’s Two Flag Traditions

Bruce Patterson

Introduction

This year has marked the fiftieth anniversary of the National Flag of Canada, and today I shall be speaking about this flag as the culmination of a postwar flag tradition that developed out of, and as a counterpoint to, another Canadian flag tradition which utilized emblems of British and (later) French heritage.

Earlier this year I delivered presentations on the Canadian flag before and after 1965; however, given the limited time I have today, I shall focus on the aspect that much of this history can be grouped into two flag traditions, with a few bridging the gap. I shall speak briefly about the Canadian red ensigns, about proposed new flags in the same tradition, and about newer approaches that led to the current National Flag—alas, I won’t have the opportunity to take us beyond that and discuss the flag since 1965. Flag proposals occurred throughout much of Canada’s first century, especially on the occasions during which the Canadian government examined the issue; however, I will confine myself to the most notable of these.

The current flag, brought into use on 15 February 1965, is the National Flag of Canada; nevertheless, the Canadian red ensign in various forms that preceded it was effectively the national flag, seen as such, and used as such, by Canadians. The adoption of the maple leaf flag in 1965 was a notable break from this history, something on which both advocates and opponents of the flag agreed. My purpose today is not to champion one and disparage the other, but to note that both flag traditions are important parts of our history and deserve examination.
I should also note there was for much of our history another flag tradition, that of the Union Jack as the flag of Canada, particularly prior to the Second World War, as can be seen in these illustrations.¹

The Canadian Red Ensign

I begin with an overview of some of the various forms of the Canadian Red Ensign. Those using the quartered arms of the provinces of Canada came into use shortly after Confederation, often as expressions of popular patriotism, and until 1904 this flag flew at Parliament itself.

In addition, the plain British red ensign, which was the Canadian flag at sea until 1892, was used as a flag on land, as is evident by the iconic 1891 Conservative poster promoting the prime minister, Sir John A. Macdonald, and his National Policy. The red ensign tradition actually reaches back much further, with the flags of the Hudson’s Bay Company and the North West Company used as symbols of sovereignty over much of what is now Canada.

The distinctively Canadian red ensigns went through many iterations, showing shields of four, five, seven and nine provincial (or, in one case, territorial)
emblems combined on one shield, as you can see from these examples from the Spence collection currently held by the Canadian Museum of History. There were variations in how the arms were depicted, and even in the order in which the quarterings were displayed, as well as external ornaments such as maple and oak branches, crowns and beavers. Moreover, the use of the flags did not necessarily correspond to strictly regimented time periods, as we can see from some of these examples, with Byam Shaw’s 1918 painting of remembrance using a seven- rather than a nine-province version. The Canadian girl at the opening of the Thousand Islands Bridge in 1938 has a flag that is obviously a multi-province version that became obsolete in 1922.

**Early Suggestions to Simplify the Flag**

In spite of the widespread use of these flags, the complexity of the composite shields inevitably prompted new suggestions that could be adopted as a national flag. Many proposals were made in the magazine *The Week* in 1895, beginning with the proposal illustrated on the cover of the May 31, 1895 issue from Sanford Fleming, the former chief engineer of the Canadian Pacific Railroad. Fleming’s proposal had a star of seven points, representing the provinces at the time.² Others³ countered with designs featuring the maple leaf in one form or another—by itself, in various colours; on a disc;⁴ on a lozenge;⁵ and on a shield,⁶ which the Toronto barrister, heraldist, and genealogist E. M. Chadwick noted should not be used as the arms did not have a separate existence.⁷ Chadwick also promoted a sprig of three green maple leaves instead of a single one,⁸ on a white disc like other colonial badges. The single maple leaf idea would reappear in various proposals in the decades to come, either on its own or on a shield, an example of the latter being a proposal from 1930 by heraldist Maurice Brodeur at the provincial exposition of Québec.⁹ (Figures 5–9, next page)

One other proposal¹⁰ suggested combining the Union Jack with the French tricolour (at that point widely used in French Canada) plus the green maple leaf, something mercifully not illustrated.

**Changes to the Red Ensign**

The proclamation of the arms of Canada in 1921 resulted in an order-in-council the following year by which the Canadian red ensign (and, where applicable, the blue ensign) adopted the shield of the arms in the fly: besides its maritime use, this flag was authorized for use at Canadian diplomatic missions abroad in 1924. Further authorizations came in 1943 for the Royal
Canadian Air Force, 1944 for the Canadian Army, and 1945 for use on all Canadian government buildings—in addition to its use by individual Canadians themselves. The flag had also been displayed at the 1943 Québec Conference alongside the Union Jack and the Stars and Stripes. The flag would be altered slightly in 1957 with the change of the colour of the leaves from red to green. (Figures 10 and 11, above)
The Red Ensign and the Maple Leaf: Canada’s Two Flag Traditions

Flag Proposals Utilizing British and French Symbols

Well into the twentieth century, flag suggestions using a British ensign patterns or another combination of historical emblems (the Union Jack and the fleur-de-lis primarily) predominated. Representation of the French fact became increasingly common. As an example, in 1930 a competition by the Montreal newspaper La Presse was won by a white flag with the Union Jack in the canton and a green maple leaf in the fly, the white representing royal France.\textsuperscript{11} The fleur-de-lis also appeared, such as the proposals made by Université de Montréal professor (and president of the Ligue d’action nationale),\textsuperscript{12} and that shown in a booklet published in 1939 by Ephrem Côté of Abitibi, Québec. Côté’s offering, coming shortly after the royal tour of 1939, was intended as a “Flag of National Alliance . . . based on our national history.”\textsuperscript{13} (Figures 12–14)

![Figures 12–14. Flag suggestions with historical emblems. Sources: Bruce Patterson; Canadian Heraldic Authority, Flags and Badges of Canada, Vol. V, 239 and 252. Clockwise from top left.](image)

Particularly notable was the flag designed in December 1939\textsuperscript{14} by Colonel Archer Fortescue Duguid for the Canadian Active Service Force going overseas to serve in the Second World War. The Prime Minister, William Lyon Mackenzie King, liked the flag and indicated that it “might, in time, become the flag of Canada with perhaps different colours but identical in design,”\textsuperscript{15} although he also considered the idea of a single maple leaf. It prompted another round of discussion about possible national flags, such as that from Major D. Stuart Forbes, Athletic Manager of McGill University, Montreal.\textsuperscript{16}

The battle flag nevertheless did not win the affection of the troops,\textsuperscript{17} and the Army Council and the Cabinet War Committee decided that the Canadian
Red Ensign would be the official flag of the Canadian Army. This was formalized by orders in January and May 1944.18

In 1944, a publication entitled *L’histoire du drapeau canadien* by the Québec educator Eugène Achard promoted a flag combining the white cross on blue of royal French merchant flags, the red cross of St. George, the maple leaf, and the star as a North American symbol, here numbered nine to represent the Canadian provinces at the time. Although the leaf and star arrangement is not ideal, the flag is quite attractive, albeit very similar to the flag of Iceland. I am unaware of any versions of this flag that were actually manufactured, but I recently discovered the existence of a similar flag from 1964 in the collection of the Canadian Museum of History, on a web post by Forrest Pass. It is likely this flag, which was hung in the Parliamentary Flag Committee’s meeting room, was based on the Achard design, with some rearrangements to acknowledge the fact that there were now ten Canadian provinces—and the larger white cross was perhaps a way of differencing the flag from that of Iceland. (Figures 15 and 16)

To jump ahead slightly, another design from Québec from c. 1949 by G. A. Henstridge of St. Lambert, was endorsed by the Québec Command of the Canadian Legion and the Lions Clubs of Ontario and Québec.19
In 1945, the prime minister, Mackenzie King, tasked a parliamentary committee with examining the question of a national flag for Canada, and the result of its deliberations (having received thousands of proposals from the public) was the red ensign with, in the fly, a gold maple leaf outlined in white, which King had earlier indicated was his personal preference. Figure 17) The prime minister nevertheless decided against proceeding further. As two of these illustrations indicate, new proposals would have to contend with the devotion of many returning veterans who associated the red ensign with their wartime service. The third image, showing pride at French Canadian participation in the liberation of Europe, flanked the Union Flag with the red ensign and the fleur-de-lis flag.

Perhaps the most notable rival design in this period was that proposed in the early 1940s by the Native Sons of Canada and the *Ligue du drapeau national*. In many ways this was a precursor to the National Flag, in its simple construction, the predominance of the maple leaf, and the absence of historical elements, although the explanation was that the red was chosen as an English colour and white as a French. (Figure 18 next page) Advocacy for this flag occurred across the country, but was most notable in Francophone communities, and among some provincial and federal politicians from Québec. In an interview in 1958, a spokesman for the Native Sons noted that 4,000 to 5,000 flags had been distributed, the hope being that popular use would force the government to act. Prior to the flag debate of 1964, this was essentially the default design for a new Canadian flag. (Figure 18, next page)

**“Clean Slate” Designs**

Beginning essentially in the 1950s, flag proposals that did not use combinations of allusions to Britain and France began to appear. Whereas designs
from before and during the Second World War sought to represent both major linguistic cultures as an expression of national unity, many postwar designs saw the solution as “neither” rather than “both,” a view that also aligned with trends in graphic design at this time, not to mention an increasingly popular cult of the new.

As we have seen, the predominant use of the maple leaf was an idea that had been in circulation for decades. A cartoon from 1903 is rather a surprise to see, as it looks very much like the 1965 flag: it is, nevertheless, a bit deceptive, in that “national” almost certainly refers to the French-Canadian nation and not the Dominion of Canada. The proposed design also likely uses blue and red side bars, reflecting the popular use of the tricolour among French Canadians in the latter half of the nineteenth century: the cartoon upholds this tradition in the face of the recent introduction of the Sacré-Coeur flag, held by the little fellow in front, which nevertheless would prevail as a symbol of Québec.

In the mid-1950s, a Québec Liberal M.P. who was subsequently appointed to the Senate, Jean-François Poulion, advocated for a national flag that would feature a green maple leaf on a red background. The colours contrast poorly with each other, but Pouliot chose them to combine the green of the House of Commons and the red of the Senate. It is difficult to imagine many Canadians showing much enthusiasm—then or now—for such reasoning!
A famed Canadian painter who made his own proposals for a flag was A. Y. Jackson, one of which showed the three maple leaves on one stem from the arms of Canada, with wavy blue edgings representing Canada’s rivers at the top and bottom of the flag. Without the blue elements, this design was favoured by Fortescue Duguid from 1945 and was the choice in 1963 of John Matheson, the member of parliament who came to advise Prime Minister Lester Pearson on the flag question.

For some, however, even maple leaves were contentious. In 1962 Québec archivist Luc-Andre Biron argued against any sort of symbol with historical associations, advocating instead a white flag bearing a green polar star, representing the location of the magnetic north pole within Canadian territory.

For some, however, even maple leaves were contentious. In 1962 Québec archivist Luc-Andre Biron argued against any sort of symbol with historical associations, advocating instead a white flag bearing a green polar star, representing the location of the magnetic north pole within Canadian territory.

Figure 19. Luc-Andre Biron’s proposal of 1962. Source: Bruce Patterson.

I’ve spoken of the influence of graphic design in this period, and a particularly well-publicized manifestation of it came in a contest by Canadian Art magazine in 1963. The winning entry, by Montreal artist Rolland Lavoie, is shown here (Figure 20), although the joining of the red and blue halves is perhaps indicative of British and French heritage, and the use of these two colours appears in many other finalists published in the magazine.

Figure 20. Rolland Lavoie’s design of 1963. Source: Canadian Heraldic Authority, Public Register of Arms, Flags and Badges of Canada, Vol. V, 255.
The second-place winner, from James Sanders of Toronto, is more familiar: a stylized maple leaf in red on a white field. Other finalists use either maple leaves or geometric shapes (or both). In spite of the popularity of maple leaves among at least some of the designs, there is a preponderance of “modernist abstraction” among the 789 entries, reflective of the fact that the contest was geared towards graphic designers and artists rather than historians or public servants. One of the judges, Guy Viau of the Canada Arts Council, commented that a Canadian flag must, first of all, indicate that “we have cut the umbilical cord attaching us to the mother countries. . . . I was resolved, as a member of the jury, to systematically eliminate every submission carrying Fleurs-de-Lis or Union Jacks,” an attitude that would be shared by Liberal leader Lester B. Pearson and his allies in the development of the current flag.

Indeed, in a study on the development of the Canadian flag from the perspective of graphic design, Michael Large notes that the flag was “the most nationally significant (and destined to be the most durable) Canadian design artifact from the 1960s.” In both the design itself and in the rendering of the leaf undertaken by Jacques St-Cyr, the flag represents the international style in graphic design at the time, a spare “purist approach.” In many ways the National Flag was a product of its time, not only from the perspective of the 1960s being a time of social upheaval and a rupturing from old forms and traditions, but its artwork was characterized by sparse, austere, and abstract design. In corporate graphic design, this was a golden age, and Canada was part of this trend, as can be seen from these examples.

Returning to the idea of the three maple leaves, in March 1964 Alan Beddoe proposed a variation with the addition of blue bars on either side, representing the concept of “From sea to sea,” which appealed greatly to the Prime Minister, Lester B. Pearson. (Figure 21) It was this flag that Pearson hoped would be adopted by a resolution in parliament in fulfillment of a longstanding Liberal campaign plank, although he soon discovered that this would not be a simple or painless process. The design, which the leader of the opposition, John Diefenbaker, derided as the “Pearson Pennant” was the focus of the early phase of the flag debate. Although it would be eventually be replaced by a single maple leaf, the concept of keeping British and French symbols out of the flag remained a touchstone for Pearson and those backing his initiative, representing a belief that the elimination of historical symbols—beyond the maple leaf itself—was necessary to make the flag a vehicle for national unity, certainly a contentious issue for many Canadians of varying backgrounds.
Although Conservative leader John Diefenbaker felt an affinity to the red ensign, he was willing to consider other design that would include historical references, one possibility being a red ensign with a *fleur-de-lis* in place of the arms of Canada.\(^3^4\) (Figure 22) Québec conservative M.P. Clément Vincent advocated for a handsome design by Jean Dubuc of Sainte-Foy during the course of the flag debate in August 1964, using the two colours and with the crosses carrying explicit Christian symbolism for him.\(^3^5\)

Although Pearson’s choice was carried through to the end of the deliberations of the parliamentary flag committee, the government members on the committee ultimately switched their preference to the single maple leaf flag. This proposal had been surreptitiously introduced by committee member John Matheson\(^3^6\) based on a design proposal made by historian George Stanley in March 1964, with the proportions of the design influenced by Toronto graphic...
designer George Bist. The committee had earlier rejected the idea of having the red ensign as one of the choices, and the notion of a flag with British and French elements was made one of the final selections in an almost perfunctory combination of the maple leaf flag and a small union Jack and royal French Flag, something unlikely to satisfy either side of the debate.

Figure 23. Proposed design for the final round of voting. Source: Canadian Heraldic Authority, Public Register of Arms, Flags and Badges of Canada, Vol. V, 263.

The committee’s recommendation was debated by the House of Commons until closure was imposed and it was passed in a divided house. During the period of the debate, a final step that was taken was the reworking of the maple leaf by government artist Jacques St-Cyr, replacing the rather angular 13-point leaf with the 11-point one we know today. (Figure 24) The flag came into widespread use throughout the country by the government, military, and, of course, Canadians at large.

Figure 24. The artwork of Jacques St-Cyr for the 11-point national flag. Source: Canadian Heraldic Authority, Public Register of Arms, Flags and Badges of Canada, Vol. IV, 460.
Ontario and Manitoba: Survival of a Flag Tradition

The rejection of the red ensign tradition was not complete, however, as the adoption of the National Flag was followed by provincial flags for Ontario and Manitoba. Also, Newfoundland declared it would use the Union Flag as its provincial flag, and British Columbia permitted the use of the Canadian Red Ensign alongside the provincial flag.

The adoption of Ontario’s flag is an interesting contrast to its national counterpart. (Figure 25) It happened on the initiative of the premier, John Robarts; following his decision, it was subject to a brief debate and was passed with near-unanimity by the provincial legislature. To Robarts the advantage of introducing a provincial flag so soon after the new national Flag that it was not a question of “either/or” but simply “and also”: it was not taking anything away from enthusiasts for the maple leaf flag, but it gave something to those who supported the older tradition—which, in a way, perhaps made acceptance of the former easier. As Robarts noted to a colleague, “It’s damn good politics.”

This year there were articles published in the press advocating a change to the provincial flag, but these were countered by the creation of an Ontario Flag Day by a private member’s bill passed unanimously by the provincial legislature on 3 June 2015. Changing the flag is an issue that has never attracted interest at the political level.

Figure 25. The provincial flag of Ontario. Source: Canadian Heraldic Authority, Public Register of Arms, Flags and Badges of Canada, Vol. VI, 2.

Under Premier Duff Roblin, Manitoba adopted a very similar red ensign in 1966, for similar reasons. (Figure 26, next page) Like Ontario, no suggestions to change the flag proposals appeared anywhere. A legacy of the national flag debate appears to be a chill over further flag discussions at a high level.
Conclusion

Of the ubiquity of the maple leaf flag, particularly in English Canada, there can be no doubt. It is, nevertheless, important to remember that for much of Canada’s first century, the country was represented by a different flag, the Canadian red ensign in various forms, and even a succession of suggestions to replace this flag followed a similar pattern of including emblematic references to Canada’s British and French heritage. In the years leading up to the 1964 Flag Debate, however, designs focusing exclusively on the simple allusions to Canada began appearing as options, and this approach became the focus of the Liberal government at the time, which resulted in the flag we now have.

The red ensign idea has persisted, most notably in the provincial flags and for limited commemoration purposes. For a significant number of Canadians of varying viewpoints in 1965, the loss of the red ensign was regrettable—and this view can also be heard from young Canadians born long after the flag debate. This is not a widespread opinion, but it does exist, and there are also those who, while not disparaging the current National Flag, believe the Red Ensign is worth considering as a part of our history, and after fifty years an acknowledgement of this is certainly not a threat to the position of the National Flag. I was intrigued to discover recently a new comic book character called “the Red Ensign,” an imagining of a Second World-War Canadian superhero giving the Nazis what-for, created by cartoonist Scott Chandler in 2014. I shall end with this character alongside the 1975 comic book hero Captain Canuck, saying that in this anniversary year it is useful to reflect both of these traditions.
End Notes

1. For an examination of the use of the Red Ensign versus the Union Jack in Canadian schools, see Forrest Pass, “‘Something Occult in the Science of Flag-Flying’: School Flags and Educational Authority in Early Twentieth-Century Canada,” *The Canadian Historical Review* 96, no. 3 (Sept 2014): 321–51.


3. E. M. Chadwick, for example, claimed a star “would be a complete novelty for Canada,” un-British and republican, imitative of American emblems. Letter in *The Week*, 7 June 1895, 664.

4. A recommendation of the Canadian Club of Hamilton, designed by H. Spencer Howell, illustrated on the cover of the 20 September 1895 issue of *The Week*.


7. Sir Eugene Fiset would propose a single maple leaf on a white shield for the arms of Canada in 1919, and noted that this would work well on a flag, and it is likely he would have been thinking of placing it in the fly of a red ensign. This design would enjoy a curious revival with its adoption in 1981 as the flag of the Grand Lodge of Canada of the Orange Order, the difference being the orange field of the flag.


16. Reynolds, “‘To Make the Unmistakable Signal “Canada,”” 16.
27. I was taken aback earlier this year when I attended an exhibit of paintings by the notable Canadian abstract artist Jack Bush at the National Gallery of Canada: one of the paintings, Split Circle #2, from 1961, bears an uncanny resemblance to the Lavoie flag proposal two years later.
31. Ibid., 42.
32. Beddoe also favoured the inclusion of a Royal Crown in the flag, but this was not the version presented to Pearson. Chris Champion, *The Strange Demise of British Canada* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2010), 191.
33. It was against this design that a group of notable Canadians, from various political, regional, and cultural backgrounds, protested in an open letter in which a request was made for the inclusion of historical emblems. See “Canada’s National Symbols—An Appeal to Mr. Pearson,” *Canadian Forum*, 44 (June 1964): 54.
34. John George Diefenbaker, *One Canada*, volume 3 (Toronto: Macmillan of Canada, 1977), 225. The proposal was enunciated at that time by Conservative M.P.

35. http://ycvincent.voila.net/OTTAWA.htm

36. As he noted “if a good flag was to come out of committee, I would have to choose it,” See Matheson, *Canada’s Flag*, 126.


38. Only two opposition members opposed it.

39. See http://tvo.org/blog/current-affairs/steve-paikin-is-it-time-for-a-new-flag-for-ontario-

40. See http://www.ontario.ca/laws/statute/s15021

41. As the *Winnipeg Tribune* noted, the new flag would “go far to assuage the wounds felt by many in the province over the abandonment of the Red Ensign as the national flag.” Quoted in *Flagscan* 59 (Autumn 2000): 4.

42. For example, after the NAVA’s 2001 State and Provincial Flag Design survey ranked Manitoba’s flag at the bottom of Canadian provincial flags, the *Winnipeg Free Press* hosted a contest to design a new flag, announced on 22 July 2001, but not taken up further.